

**10 DCCE2004/2401/F - PROPOSED REPLACEMENT OF TWO DWELLINGS 5 AND 6 GRAFTON COURT CLOSE, GRAFTON, HEREFORD, HEREFORDSHIRE, HR2 8BL****For: Mrs. H.A. Phillips & Mr. R. Waddington, John Phipps, Bank Lodge, Coldwells Road, Holmer, Hereford, HR1 1LH****Date Received: 1st July 2004****Ward: Hollington****Grid Ref: 49678, 37158****Expiry Date: 26th August 2004**

Local Member: Councillor W.J.S. Thomas

**1. Site Description and Proposal**

- 1.1 The application site comprises a pair of semi-detached bungalows, gardens and detached triple garage on land that lies to the east side of the cul-de-sac known as Grafton Close and to the rear of the relatively modern dwellings at Graftonbury Rise. The dwellings were originally built as staff accommodation for the nearby Graftonbury Hotel. The site has mature landscaping to its periphery as well as around the existing garage area, and is well screened from Grafton Lane. The application site also lies outside of any defined settlement boundary, and as such within an area designated as Open Countryside.
- 1.2 The current application is for the replacement of the two dwellings, with two three bed detached 'cottages'. One dwelling would be located towards the south east of the plot, nearest Grafton Lane and on the footprint of the triple garage, with the second dwelling in a more central location in the site. The dwelling would be two storey, with dormer style windows in the upper floor. Each dwelling would have separate vehicular access and garden space.

**2. Policies****2.1 Planning Policy Guidance:**

PPG7 - Sustainable development in rural areas

**2.2 Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan:**

CTC2 - Areas of Great Landscape Value

H20 - Housing in rural areas

**2.3 South Herefordshire District Local Plan:**

C1 - Development within open countryside

C8 - Development within AGLV

SH21 - Replacement dwellings

GD1 - General development criteria

### 3. Planning History

- 3.1 25460 - Erection of two semi-detached chalets at Graftonbury Garden Hotel. Approved with conditions April 1968.
- 3.2 DCCE2004/3518/U - Continued use of bungalows as full time residential units unconnected with Graftonbury Hotel since 1973.

### 4. Consultation Summary

#### Statutory Consultations

- 4.1 None received

#### Internal Council Advice

- 4.2 The Traffic Manager has no objections to this proposal.

### 5. Representations

- 5.1 Grafton Parish Council has no objection.
- 5.2 Hereford City Council (adjoining parish) has no objection.
- 5.3 Letters of objection have been received from P.A. Wales of Barnstable, 2 Graftonbury Rise, Grafton Lane and Mr and Mrs Hopper of 1 Graftonbury Rise. These letters raise the following issues:
- Damage to the natural environment through removal of trees;
  - Change to and impact on the landscape character of Grafton Close;
  - Loss of privacy to adjacent dwellings - currently single storey, but proposed two storey;
  - Loss of affordable house;
  - Concerns of precedent being set for adjacent site;
  - Applicant's plan has omitted a conservatory added at 1 Graftonbury Rise.
- 5.4 The full text of these letters can be inspected at Northern Planning Services, Blueschool House, Blueschool Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

### 6. Officer's Appraisal

- 6.1 The Council's adopted policy is to allow replacement dwellings in the countryside provided "the existing dwelling is not of architectural or historic interest which it is desirable to retain and the replacement is of a size and scale similar to that of the original dwelling and is on the same site" (Policy SH21).
- 6.2 The existing dwellings are dated bungalows that are not considered to be architecturally noteworthy. The new dwellings would be substantially larger than the existing dwelling and are detached rather than semi-detached properties. As such they do not fall clearly within the remit of Policy SH21 of the Hereford Local Plan. In order to support this application, sufficient justification, in the form of material considerations should be considered to outweigh these policies that serve to protect

the open countryside. As such the main issue for the consideration of this application is whether the replacement of the bungalows with two storey detached dwellings, within this particular context would be an acceptable form of development.

- 6.3 Grafton Lane, although not recognised as a village settlement, has undergone significant development in recent years, including the development of the adjacent 'Graftonbury Rise', made up predominantly of large detached dwellings in generous amenity space. The application site itself is located within a residential 'close' and is surrounded on each side by land in residential use. Although the development does not accord with the prevalent local plan policy in its strictest interpretation, it is considered that the scheme would represent an enhancement of the visual amenity of the area and a development more in keeping with the character and appearance of the surrounds. As such, having regard to this particular site, its surrounds and its minimal intrusion on the landscape, allowing the replacement of the dwellings in the form proposed is considered to be acceptable.
- 6.4 In terms of privacy and overlooking, the dwellings have been designed and sited in such a way that upper floor windows can be obscure glazed where overlooking may be an issue. The distance between all the surrounding dwellings is sufficient to ensure that a satisfactory relationship is retained. There are no highway concerns or objections.
- 6.5 To conclude, the proposal does not in its strictest interpretation accord with the criteria of the local plan 'replacement dwelling' policy. However, sufficient weight has been given to the context of the site, its immediate surroundings and character of the immediate area, as well as impact on the neighbouring property and on balance it is felt that this proposal would be both beneficial to the immediate surroundings and a suitable replacement to the existing units.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

**That planning permission be granted subject to the following conditions:**

**1 A01 (Time limit for commencement (full permission))**

**Reason: Required to be imposed by Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.**

**2 B01 (Samples of external materials)**

**Reason: To ensure that the materials harmonise with the surroundings.**

**3 G04 (Landscaping scheme (general))**

**Reason: In order to protect the visual amenities of the area.**

**4 G05 (Implementation of landscaping scheme (general))**

**Reason: In order to protect the visual amenities of the area.**

**5 E19 (Obscure glazing to windows)**

**Reason: In order to protect the residential amenity of adjacent properties.**

- 6 The development hereby approved shall be carried out in strict accordance with the levels approved.

Reason: To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plan.

- 7 During the demolition and construction phase, no machinery shall be operated, no process shall be carried out and no deliveries taken at or despatched from the site outside of the following times, without prior consent from the local authority:

Monday - Friday 7.30am - 6.00pm, Saturday 8.00am - 1.00pm nor at any time on Sundays, Bank or public holidays.

Reason: To protect the amenity of local residents.

- 8 No materials or substances shall be incinerated within the application site during the demolition and construction phase.

Reason: To safeguard residential amenity and prevent pollution.

- 9 All machinery and plant shall be operated and maintained in accordance with BS 5228: 1984 Noise Control of Construction and open sites.

Reason: To safeguard residential amenity and prevent pollution.

- 10 H12 (Parking and turning - single house)

Reason: In the interests of highway safety and to ensure the free flow of traffic using the adjoining highway.

- 11 E16 (Removal of permitted development rights)

Reason: In order to protect the residential amenity of the surrounding properties.

**Informatives:**

- 1 HN01 - Mud on highway
- 2 HN04 - Private apparatus within highway
- 3 HN05 - Works within the highway
- 4 N15 - Reason(s) for the Grant of PP/LBC/CAC

Decision: .....

Notes: .....

.....

**Background Papers**

Internal departmental consultation replies.